

APPENDIX 4 - Summary of Submissions Report

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
1	Queenscliff Resident	<p>Strategy is biased towards the removal of trees and there is inadequate emphasis on the planting of trees. Examples given of Pt Lonsdale Road, Bellarine Highway, Citizens Park, Princess Park and Queenscliff Harbour where there is inadequate tree planting.</p> <p>A caravan park should be developed between the fort and the lighthouse and caravans removed from Victoria Park. Signs should be erected at the parks indemnifying Council against risk.</p> <p>Trees should be replanted at a 3 to 1 ratio.</p>	Cypress	<p>Not agreed. A range of management options other than removal are discussed and recommended.</p> <p>Report recommends plantings and suggests future plantings be identified in a management plan for individual sites.</p> <p>Relocation of camping to Shortlands Bluff is outside the scope of this report.</p> <p>A range of signs warning of tree danger have been recommended and may go some way towards lessening the risk of dangerous trees.</p> <p>Suggested tree planting ratio noted</p>
2	Queenscliff Victoria Park Regular Camper	Camping has been a tradition for generations of families. The trees provide shade and shelter and have not been deliberately damaged by campers.	Cypress Sheoaks Wattles	Agreed

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
3	Queenscliffe Environment Forum	<p>The number of trees to be removed is excessive. Dangerous trees can be fenced off and protected. Existing trees should be mulched and watered.</p> <p>The cost of the plan is excessive.</p> <p>Trees should be replanted at 4 to 1 ratio.</p> <p>The Moonah reserves in Victoria Park should be extended along Mercer and King Streets.</p> <p>The 3 trees at the corner of Mercer and King should be retained.</p> <p>Coppicing is not supported.</p> <p>Cabins are strongly opposed in any location.</p> <p>No cars should be permitted in the parks. Princess Park an example of devastation.</p>	<p>Port Jackson Figs along Gellibrand Street and some Moreton Bay Figs in the parks.</p> <p>More alternative species required.</p>	<p>Some fencing proposed.</p> <p>Report suggests some mulching.</p> <p>Costs have been estimated by consultant and would need to be verified in the market.</p> <p>Suggested tree planting ratio noted.</p> <p>Strategy proposes extensions of Moonah Reserves in future years.</p> <p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) not supported in strategy.</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Difficult to exclude cars when camping permitted in Vic park.</p> <p>Other parks primarily service vehicles (apart from Hot Rod Show and other</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>The lifespan of 10 years + is misleading as some trees will still be growing in 100 years.</p> <p>Year round camping in Victoria Park not supported: alternative location near the Bull Ring.</p> <p>Norfolk Island Hibiscus should not be removed. Norfolk Island pines not supported.</p> <p>Ecological evaluation of the trees supported.</p>		<p>major events)</p> <p>10 year timeframe reflects the timeframe of the strategy.</p> <p>Note objection to year round camping and Shortlands Bluff suggestion.</p> <p>Removal of Norfolk Island Hibiscus would be an OH&S decision.</p> <p>Noted</p>
4	Queenscliff Resident	<p>Trees should be fenced off. . The lifespan of 10 years + is misleading as some trees will still be growing in 100 years.</p> <p>Norfolk Island Pines not supported.</p>	<p>Gums in corner of Victoria Park.</p> <p>Woolamai Pines</p> <p>Port Jackson Figs in Gellibrand Street.</p> <p>More alternative species required.</p> <p>Citizens :Agonis flexuosa</p> <p>Corymba ficifolia.</p>	<p>Note support of fencing but in officers opinion this is impractical in all instances.</p> <p>10 year timeframe reflects the timeframe of the strategy.</p> <p>Noted.</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>No cars should be permitted in the parks.</p> <p>Victoria Park should be a Botanical Garden.</p> <p>Year round camping not supported. No Moonahs should be removed. The Moonah reserves in Victoria Park should be extended along Mercer and King Streets.</p> <p>The 3 trees at the corner of Mercer and King should be retained, but if removed should be replaced with eucalypts e.g. Mann or Bellarine yellow gums, casuarinas, understorey, wattles, banksias, etc. And groundcovers. Interpretive material should be installed.</p> <p>Camping for the festival should be in the football oval and not Victoria Park. No gazebos or cooking should be allowed.</p> <p>Princess Park: trees should be fenced off and retained. Citizens Park: fence</p>		<p>Difficult to exclude cars when camping permitted in Vic park.</p> <p>Other parks primarily service vehicles (apart from Hot Rod Show and other major events)</p> <p>Botanic Garden declaration outside the scope of this report.</p> <p>Strategy proposes extensions of Moonah Reserves in future years</p> <p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) noted but not supported in strategy</p> <p>Camping on the oval suggestion outside the scope of this strategy</p> <p>See previous comment about fencing.</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		off and retain trees.		
5	Point Lonsdale Resident	<p>Some trees identified as dangerous have not lost branches -assumed the arborist has been conservative (particularly Cypress).</p> <p>Council congratulated on the strategy long overdue.</p> <p>The general directions should be accepted.</p> <p>Suggested that Council only remove the very worst trees and commence replanting.</p> <p>Cost of the strategy is very high and not in the budget.</p> <p>Relocate some camping in Victoria Park to Shortlands Bluff. Long term removal of camping supported.</p> <p>3 trees corner of King and Mercer should be fenced off and retained.</p>	Cypress Shade trees near Harrys.	<p>Agree. Arborist has given professional opinion.</p> <p>Agree strategy is overdue</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Report recommends removal of 'worst' trees in Year 1.</p> <p>Note comment on cost of strategy.</p> <p>Relocation of camping to Shortlands Bluff is outside the scope of this report</p> <p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) noted but not supported in strategy</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
6	Resident of Queenscliff	<p>Criticism of process for the strategy: length of exhibition, timelines, no individual meetings with community groups.</p> <p>Heritage not covered sufficiently.</p> <p>References in the strategy inadequate.</p> <p>Focus on tree removal rather than retention.</p> <p>Relocate campers from Victoria Park.</p> <p>Cypresses surviving quite well in Princess and Citizens Park.</p>	<p>Queensland kauris not supported (no shade).</p> <p>Monterey Cypress</p> <p>Morton Bay Fig</p> <p>Park Jackson Fig</p> <p>Moonah</p> <p>Boobialla</p> <p>Aleppo Pine</p> <p>Stone Pine</p> <p>Coastal Banksia</p> <p>Sheoaks</p> <p>Western Austn Myrtle.</p> <p>More exotic and native trees in Victoria Park.</p>	<p>Disagree. Details of communication strategy provided in report. Councillors and officers gave presentations and answered questions at Public meeting called by PLCA and QCA on 14 August 2009</p> <p>Consultant has specialist heritage skills and considered a range of heritage issues in report</p> <p>Comment noted</p> <p>Not agreed. A range of management options other than removal are discussed and recommended.</p> <p>Report recommends plantings and suggests future plantings be identified in a management plan for individual sites.</p> <p>Relocation of camping from Victoria Park is outside the scope of this report</p> <p>A number of recent arborist reports identify issues with over mature Cypress .</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>Moonah Reserves should be extended along Mercer and King Streets.</p> <p>3 cypress on King/Mercer Street corner should be retained.</p> <p>Citizens Park requires shaded areas and tables.</p> <p>Without replanting wind patterns in Princess Park will be destructive.</p> <p>Coppicing not supported - another type of removal.</p> <p>Cost of strategy - where is the source of funding?</p>		<p>Strategy proposes extensions of Moonah Reserves in future years.</p> <p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) noted but not supported in strategy</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Potential sources of funding discussed in report but priority areas would need to be determined by Council.</p>
7	Resident of Queenscliff	Such widespread removal not needed.	<p>Port Jackson Fig for shade (climate change).</p> <p>Species other than Norfolk Island Pine along Gellibrand Street.</p>	Consultant has given professional opinion based on tree condition and park usage.

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>Mitigate risk by removing people from under them (camping/Hot Rod Show).</p> <p>Reconfigure camping areas.</p> <p>Criticism of PCG composition and process.</p> <p>Support for Cypress as signature tree for Queenscliff.</p> <p>Strategy refers to draft Heritage Study not seen by the public.</p> <p>Planning Scheme provisions not covered adequately e.g. Heritage overlays.</p> <p>Public Open Space Policy required.</p> <p>Cost of strategy - how is it to be financed when not in the budget?</p> <p>Heritage value of Victoria Park needs to be given more weight.</p>	Stone Pines.	<p>Some risk mitigation actions suggest removal of targets from under dangerous trees eg mulched beds, Moonah Reserves.</p> <p>Noted. Report does recommend some reconfiguring of camping areas</p> <p>Note criticism of PCG composition</p> <p>Note support for Cypress spp</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Not in scope of consultants brief but discussed in officer report</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Potential sources of funding discussed in report but priority areas would need to be determined by Council.</p> <p>Noted. Consultant has specialist heritage skills and considered a range of heritage issues in report.</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>3 cypress corner King/Mercer should be retained.</p> <p>Princess Park will be stark. Suggest relocating Hot Rod Show to Lower Princess Park and Weeroona Pd</p> <p>Other risk strategies should be developed other than tree removal.</p>		<p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) noted but not supported in strategy</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Agreed. A range of management options other than removal are discussed and recommended.</p>
8	Resident of Queenscliff	<p>Some trees incorrectly marked with ribbons.</p> <p>A proper Risk Management Assessment required.</p> <p>Heritage trees should be preserved.</p> <p>3 trees corner of King and Mercer should be retained.</p>		<p>Incorrectly marked trees not identified</p> <p>Further work on Risk assessment has been undertaken by ArbEcology</p> <p>Consultant has specialist heritage skills and considered a range of heritage issues in report</p> <p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) noted but not supported in strategy</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>Replanting should be a priority, not in one year's time.</p> <p>Victoria Park in Botanic Gardens precinct.</p> <p>Impact on the environment of tree removal.</p>		<p>Replanting advice has been received by consultant to maximise results</p> <p>Agreed. Strategy addresses Botanic Garden status</p> <p>Noted. Permits required for native vegetation. Discussed in report</p>
9	Queenscliffe Community Association	<p>See submission 6 above.</p> <p>Criticism of process</p> <p>Inadequate attention to Heritage.</p> <p>References inadequate.</p> <p>Two papers attached for information.</p> <p>Moonahs should be assessed by an ecologist.</p> <p>Loss of trees will mean loss of tourists and their expenditure in the town.</p>	Port Jackson Fig along Gellibrand Street adjacent to Princess Park and WA Myrtles along Citizens Park.	<p>Details of communication strategy provided in report. Councillors and officers gave presentations and answered questions at Public meeting called by PLCA and QCA on 14 August 2009</p> <p>Consultant has specialist heritage skills and considered a range of heritage issues in report</p> <p>Note comment</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		<p>Victoria Park is primarily for passive recreation.</p> <p>Removals should be staged.</p> <p>Changed wind patterns after removals will be a problem.</p> <p>Query on income from camping</p> <p>Cost of strategy and source of funding questioned.</p> <p>Coppicing same as removal.</p> <p>Moonahs should be extended along Mercer and King Streets plus throughout the reserve.</p> <p>Corner of Victoria Park should be extended.</p> <p>A species garden should be established in Citizens Park.</p> <p>Council should indemnify themselves from risk in Victoria Park.</p>		<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted. Removals are staged.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>All incomes generated on Crown Lands are spent on Council managed Crown Lands in the Borough</p> <p>Potential sources of funding discussed in report but priority areas would need to be determined by Council</p> <p>Comment noted.</p> <p>Strategy proposes extensions of Moonah Reserves in future years</p> <p>Noted.</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Council have received legal advice on this issue which is discussed in report</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
10	Resident of Point Lonsdale	<p>Historic trees should be preserved, not removed.</p> <p>Reduce number of people under trees eg campers relocated to Fort or market area.</p> <p>Research indemnity policies</p> <p>Moonahs should be extended along King and Mercer Streets.</p> <p>Cabins not supported in Victoria Park.</p> <p>3 cypress corner of King and Mercer should be fenced and retained with understorey planting.</p> <p>Norfolk Island Hibiscus should be retained.</p> <p>Replanting should occur immediately.</p> <p>Strategy does not address climate change.</p>	<p>Stone Pines (habitat)</p> <p>Port Jackson Fig in Gellibrand Street</p>	<p>Consultant has specialist heritage skills and considered a range of heritage issues in report</p> <p>This is one action of many which has been identified in the report to reduce risk.</p> <p>Further information has been received on indemnity issues</p> <p>Strategy proposes extensions of Moonah Reserves in future years</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Retention of Trees corner Mercer and King (Cypress) noted but not supported in strategy</p> <p>Removal of Norfolk Island Hibiscus would be an OH&S decision.</p> <p>Advice has been received on optimum planting times</p> <p>Noted</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
11	Resident of Queenscliff	<p>Budget and financial imposts substantial meaning replanting may not occur.. What is the financial strategy - community should be informed.</p> <p>Adequate risk assessment required.</p> <p>Council should comply with its own policies and planning scheme (obtain planning permits and have regard to heritage).</p> <p>Removal of trees will detract from tourist appeal and income.</p> <p>Removal should be staged and replanting immediate in open space or along streets.</p> <p>Removal will result in loss of wind protection and subsequent effects.</p> <p>Criticism of process: lack of consultation.</p>		<p>Noted. Potential sources of funding discussed in report but priority areas would need to be determined by Council</p> <p>Further work on Risk assessment has been undertaken by ArbEcology</p> <p>Agreed</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Proposed removals are staged. Advice has been received on optimum planting times</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Details of community consultation plan provided in report.</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		Effects on fauna and avifauna should be examined. Existing trees should be maintained through the drought.		Noted but outside scope of this strategy Noted
12	Camper at Victoria Park Queenscliff	Long family history of camping at Queenscliff will end with little notice. Campers contribute and become part of the community. Trees should not be fenced off - trees have a natural lifespan. Campers do not greatly impact on trees. Loss of campers will mean substantial loss of income to Council. Campers will be displaced.		Noted Noted Noted Noted Noted. Financial implications discussed in strategy Agreed.
13	Resident of Point Lonsdale	Congratulations on a comprehensive report although consultation period could have been longer. Princess Park and Citizens: pines should not be the replacement species - use indigenous. Against camping in Victoria Park which restricts public use.	Indigenous species	Noted Range of species considered Noted

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
		Financial review should be undertaken (5 suggestions given, including establishing 2 new camping grounds at Toch H and Murray Rd. Replant at Victoria Park with camping in mind).		Financial implications will need to be further considered
14	Resident of Point Lonsdale	<p>Supports Moonah reserves: they provide habitat, are very old and are protected under the Flora and Fauna Guarantee Act. Will foster public understanding and stewardship of the Moonah.</p> <p>Moonah reserves should include planting of understorey plants and interpretive signage.</p>		<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p>
15	Pt Lonsdale Civic Association	<p>Most recommendations of the strategy and policy statements strongly endorsed.</p> <p>However, iconic and heritage trees should be fenced off until replacement plantings established.</p> <p>Community groups and individuals may contribute to the cost.</p> <p>Financial impost of the strategy is great and external funding sources should be accessed/maximised.</p>		<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted. Option considered by consultant</p> <p>Noted</p> <p>Agreed</p>

Submission Number	Submission From	Summary	Tree Species Preferred (If Specified)	Officer Comments
16	Resident of Queenscliff	<p>Congratulations to the council on the strategy.</p> <p>Offer to volunteer to water trees planted.</p>	Norfolk Island Pines in Gellibrand Street supported.	<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted</p>
17	Camper at Victoria Park, Queenscliff	Have a long history of camping at Queenscliff and contributed to local businesses. Support the planting and maintenance programme if camping can continue. If sites are not able to be occupied, alternatives at Victoria Park should be provided.		Noted. Limited alternatives available in Victoria Park